



## Health risk of heavy metal exposure in vegetable around owukpa coal mine field, north central Nigeria

G.G Yebpella, R.O.A Adelagun, Michael A. Abakpa \* and Johnson Gani

*Department of Chemical Science, Federal University Wukari, P.M.B 1020 Wukari Katsina- Ala Road Wukari, Taraba Stata.*

Open Access Research Journal of Life Sciences, 2023, 05(02), 027–033

Publication history: Received on 23 March 2023; revised on 03 May 2023; accepted on 06 May 2023

Article DOI: <https://doi.org/10.53022/oarjls.2023.5.2.0026>

### Abstract

The evaluation of trace metals in the environmental around Owukpa coal mine field, Ogbadibo Local Government Area, Benue State Nigeria was carried out to evaluate the degree of contamination due to mining activity in the area. The mean concentration of selected heavy metals (Ni, Fe, Cd, Cr, Pb and Mn) in Vegetables (*Vernonia amygdalina*) around coal mines were investigated. Results of the atomic absorption spectrophotometric (AAS) were as follows Ni (4.47), Fe (29.18), Cd (1.27), Cr (3.76), Pb (4.64), and Mn (12.84) with a variation pattern in the order: Fe>Mn>Pb>Ni>Cr>Cd. It was observed that the trend of EDIs for heavy metals in the samples were in the order of Fe > Mn > Pb > Ni > Cr > Cd. The HRIs of Ni, Cd, Cr and Pb were higher than 1 (HRI > 1), with Carcinogenic Risk values of Cd (0.0668), Cr (0.0157), Fe (0.2432), Mn (0.1070), Ni (0.0340), and Pb (0.0003), respectively.

**Keywords:** Heavy metals; Carcinogenic; Pollution; Concentration and Vegetables

### 1. Introduction

The Pollution of the environment has over the years gained increase at alarming rate due to different natural and anthropogenic (industrial) activities (Dontala *et al.*, 2015). Several of these pollutants are persistent and accumulate beyond the permissible limits. They are very toxic to biological system and may be accumulated to higher trophic levels through food chain contamination (Iftikharet *et al.*, 2017).

Heavy metals have the potential to accumulate and migrate in the soil environment. Metal pollutants in soil are absorbed by the plants through their roots and vascular system. Accumulation of metals in soil could pose a threat to animals, plants, and human and affect the ecosystem safety (Codex, 2015). High content of metals in the plant could inhibit the ability of the plant to produce chlorophyll, increase the plant oxidative stress and weaken stomata resistance (Ashraf *et al.*, 2011). Unnaturally occurring heavy metals such as cadmium (Cd) and chromium (Cr) may suppress the growth of a plant, whether the pollution comes from soil or air (Enetimi and syvester, 2019). Perchance heavy metals can enter human bodies via the food chain, leading to increment of chronic diseases such as cancer and affecting the central nervous system, particularly in children (Zhao *et al.*, 2009).

Plants growing at the roadside might be exposed to high levels of metal contamination, especially through vehicle emissions and trace content in the air (Al-Ashkar, 2007). Heavy metal from traffic emission might accumulate in roadside plants from the soil (Feng *et al.*, 2011). Heavy metals from activities involving traffic could accumulate in the soil before being absorbed by plant roots. Because heavy metals are resistant and stay in the plant for a long time (Boularbahet *et al.*, 2006), they may be transferred to humans via the food chain (Zhang *et al.*, 2018). The bioavailability of heavy metals is primarily affected by the soil's plant species (Koz and Cevik 2014; Keshavarzi *et al.*, 2015; Zhao and Duo 2015) and physical-chemical properties (Liu *et al.*, 2007). Some species of roadside plants are edible while others can be used for medicinal purposes (Chandrashekara and Thasini 2016). Certain species such as *Chromolaenaodorata* (CO) is known to be used for medicinal purposes and *Athyriumesculentum* (AE) are edible (Roslan *et al.*, 2016).

\* Corresponding author: Michael A Abakpa



### 3. Results

The results of heavy metals concentration in this study areas were represented in table 1 below. The results are expressed in mean  $\pm$  standard deviation of triplet determination as mg/kg. Results with same alphabet superscript show no significant difference while results with different alphabet superscript within the row show significant difference at  $p < 0.05$ . Where VCS represent Vegetable sample from control area while VSA to VSJ represent Vegetable samples A to J from coal mine areas. The trend of heavy metals occurrence in the vegetable were in the order  $Fe > Mn > Pb > Ni > Cr > Cd$  as presented in table 1. Similar trend in the following metals  $Mn > Ni > Cd$  was reported by Moyo et al., (2020) in vegetable obtained from Thohoyandou town area, South Africa.

**Table 1** Concentration (mg/kg) of heavy metals in vegetables around Owukpa Coal Mine field

| SAMPLE        | Cd                           | Cr                            | Fe                            | Mn                            | Ni                           | Pb                            |
|---------------|------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| VCS           | 1.82 $\pm$ 0.03 <sup>b</sup> | ND                            | 25.20 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>d</sup> | 25.86 $\pm$ 0.09 <sup>e</sup> | 4.33 $\pm$ 0.03 <sup>c</sup> | ND                            |
| VS1           | 1.21 $\pm$ 0.04 <sup>b</sup> | ND                            | 18.95 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>f</sup> | 12.15 $\pm$ 0.06 <sup>e</sup> | 3.48 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>d</sup> | 2.90 $\pm$ 0.10 <sup>c</sup>  |
| VS2           | 1.29 $\pm$ 0.04 <sup>b</sup> | 30.49 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>e</sup> | 62.10 $\pm$ 0.02 <sup>f</sup> | 9.00 $\pm$ 0.07 <sup>d</sup>  | 4.62 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>c</sup> | ND                            |
| VS3           | 1.53 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup> | 5.65 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>d</sup>  | 12.58 $\pm$ 0.02 <sup>f</sup> | 11.98 $\pm$ 0.02 <sup>e</sup> | 4.68 $\pm$ 0.02 <sup>c</sup> | ND                            |
| VS4           | 1.46 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>a</sup> | 6.05 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>c</sup>  | 26.31 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>f</sup> | 15.83 $\pm$ 0.06 <sup>e</sup> | 4.51 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup> | 6.73 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>d</sup>  |
| VS5           | 1.27 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup> | 4.05 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>c</sup>  | 38.61 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>f</sup> | 12.92 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>e</sup> | 4.66 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>d</sup> | ND                            |
| VS6           | 1.25 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup> | ND                            | 15.50 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>f</sup> | 10.15 $\pm$ 0.03 <sup>e</sup> | 4.90 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>c</sup> | 5.22 $\pm$ 0.14 <sup>d</sup>  |
| VS7           | 1.10 $\pm$ 0.02 <sup>a</sup> | 2.08 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup>  | 38.60 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>f</sup> | 30.94 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>e</sup> | 4.53 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>c</sup> | 5.85 $\pm$ 0.06 <sup>d</sup>  |
| VS8           | 1.18 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup> | 5.98 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>e</sup>  | 40.99 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>f</sup> | 3.48 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>c</sup>  | 3.90 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>d</sup> | ND                            |
| VS9           | 1.25 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>a</sup> | 2.04 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup>  | 25.54 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>f</sup> | 13.52 $\pm$ 0.04 <sup>d</sup> | 4.65 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>c</sup> | 19.78 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>e</sup> |
| VS10          | 1.11 $\pm$ 0.03 <sup>a</sup> | 1.30 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>b</sup>  | 12.64 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>f</sup> | 8.43 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>e</sup>  | 4.80 $\pm$ 0.01 <sup>c</sup> | 5.94 $\pm$ 0.00 <sup>d</sup>  |
| Mean $\pm$ SD | 1.27 $\pm$ 0.01              | 3.76 $\pm$ 0.00               | 29.18 $\pm$ 0.01              | 12.84 $\pm$ 0.03              | 4.47 $\pm$ 0.00              | 4.64 $\pm$ 0.03               |
| Range         | 1.10 - 1.53                  | 1.30- 30.49                   | 12.58-62.10                   | 3.48 - 30.94                  | 3.48 - 4.90                  | 2.90 - 19.78                  |

VCS = Vegetable control sample, VS = Vegetable sample, ND = not detected

**Table 2** Estimated Daily Intake / Carcinogenic risk of Heavy Metals in, Vegetable samples

| Experimental Plot | Estimated Daily Intake | Carcinogenic risk | Health Risk index (HRI) |
|-------------------|------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|
| Cd                | 0.0106                 | 0.0668            | 10.6000                 |
| Cr                | 0.0313                 | 0.0157            | 10.4330                 |
| Fe                | 0.2432                 | 0.2432            | 0.3470                  |
| Mn                | 0.1070                 | 0.1070            | 0.7640                  |
| Ni                | 0.0373                 | 0.0340            | 1.8650                  |
| Pb                | 0.0387                 | 0.0003            | 11.0570                 |

### 4. Discussion

#### 4.1. Cadmium concentrations (mg/kg) in vegetable sample

The concentrations of Cd in vegetables were found to be highest in the control area VCS (1.53 mg/kg) and lowest in VSJ (1.09 mg/kg) with mean content of 1.31 $\pm$ 0.01 (mg/kg). The values were above 0.82 mg/kg in tomatoes obtained in Edo State (Idowu, 2020). The mean concentration of Cd in this work was found to be above the permissible limit of 0.20 (FAO/WHO 2018). This could be as result of leaking sewage sludge from the mining site. Similar investigation was carried out on vegetables and fruits in Maharashtra, India with mean concentration of Cd (0.02 $\pm$ 0.1 mg/kg) which was within

the permissible limit (Govind *et al.*, 2022). Cadmium is a non-essential element and has no advantageous role and no nutritious ability in plants and animals including humans. According to Kabata-Pendias (2000), Cd can alter the uptake of minerals by plant, Cd concentration in soil between 5 to 30 mg/kg could cause injury to most plant species. Stomata opening, transpiration and photosynthesis have been reported to be affected by Cd.

#### 4.2. Chromium concentrations (mg/kg) in vegetable sample

Chromium concentrations (mg/kg) in each of the samples analyzed were all detected except in samples VCS, VSA and VSF which were below the detectable limit of 0.001 mg/kg (Yeppella *et al.*, 2014). Cr is a toxic metal that can cause severe health challenge to plants and animals whether at low or high concentration. Cr content vary from 1.30 to 30.50 (mg/kg) among the vegetable samples analyzed (table 1) with mean concentration of  $5.24 \pm 0.01$  mg/kg. The mean value reported in this work was also found to be lower than 1.01, 1.34 and 2.14 (mg/kg) as reported for artisanal mining site of Dilimi, Bukuru and Barkin Ladi North Central Nigeria respectively (Orisakwe *et al.*, 2018). The mean concentration of Cr in the present work is higher than the FAO/WHO (2006) acceptable limit of 0.2 mg/kg in vegetables (Bett *et al.*, 2019). At low concentration, Cr is known to cause hyperglycemia, elevated body fat, and decreased sperm count (Girigisu *et al.*, 2020). Although chromium is known to be toxic and detrimental to plant growth and development, some plants species (hyper-accumulators) could accumulate a reasonable amount of Cr without showing any morphological symptoms (Adamu *et al.*, 2015).

#### 4.3. Iron concentrations (mg/kg) in vegetable sample

The concentration of Fe was found to be highest in sample VSB (62.10 mg/kg) and lowest in VSC (12.58 mg/kg) with mean value of  $29.18 \pm 0.01$  (mg/kg). From previous literature, Koleleni, and Tafisa (2019) reported Fe concentration of 620 mg/kg which is 21.5 times higher than Fe content obtained in this work. The mean concentration of Fe from this study was lower than the permissible limit of 425.50 (FAO/WHO 2008), this could be an indication that the level of Fe in vegetables grown near the vicinity of coal mine may not be toxic to plants, animals and humans inclusive. Iron is the most crucial element for growth and survival of almost all living organisms (Valko *et al.*, 2005).

#### 4.4. Manganese concentrations (mg/kg) in vegetable sample

Mn was found to be present in all the samples in the study area, with the highest concentration (mg/kg) in VSG (30.94 mg/kg), the lowest concentration in VSH (3.48 mg/kg) and the mean value of  $12.84 \pm 0.03$  (mg/kg) (Table 1). Yeppella *et al.*, (2011) reported a mean concentration of 17 mg/kg in vegetable grown in irrigated farm along River Kubani, which was higher than 14.02 obtained in the present work. The level of Mn in the control area was higher than those obtained near the mine fields, this show that the source of Mn contamination of vegetable may not be attributed to the mining activities rather the geology of the area or other anthropogenic sources. The average daily consumption of Mn ranged from 2.0 to 8.8 mg/kg/day (WHO, 2018). The mean concentration of Mn found in the vegetable samples was above the permissible daily intake, this implies that the vegetables could satisfy the health effects suggested for the accumulation of Mn. According to Jarup (2003), high concentration of manganese (Mn) causes hazardous effects on lungs and brains of humans.

#### 4.5. Nickel concentrations (mg/kg) in vegetable sample

The concentration (mg/kg) of Ni was found to be highest in VSF ( $4.90 \pm 0.00$ ) mg/kg and lowest in VSA ( $3.48 \pm 0.00$ ) mg/kg, with the mean concentration of  $4.47 \pm 0.01$  mg/kg as shown in table 1. From literature, Girigisu *et al.*, (2020) reported a mean concentration of 13.11 mg/kg which is relatively higher compare to each concentration of Ni in Vegetable sample obtained in this study. The mean concentration of Ni in this study is lower than the permissible limit of 67.9 (WHO/FAO, 2008). This may imply that Ni content of the vegetable in the study area may not be toxic nor have possible health effect when consumed by humans. Plants are known to accumulate nickel and as a result the nickel uptake from vegetable may be notable (Adamu *et al.*, 2015).

#### 4.6. Lead concentrations (mg/kg) in vegetable sample

Pb was not detected in sample VCS, VSB, VSC, VSE and sample VSH (Table 1). The highest concentration of Pb (mg/kg) was recorded in VSI (19.78 mg/kg) and the lowest in VSA (2.90 mg/kg) with the mean value of  $4.64 \pm 0.03$  (mg/kg) (Table 1). Yeppella *et al.*, (2014) reported a mean concentration of 31.26 mg/kg on Irrigated Vegetable Food Crops Consumed in Zaria which was 7 times higher than the mean value (4.64 mg/kg) reported in this present work this might be due to the fact that some phosphate and micronutrient fertilizers contain elevated levels of arsenic, cadmium and lead. The samples analyzed contain relatively high level of Pb than the FAO/WHO acceptable limit of 0.3 mg/kg (WHO, 2008; Castro-González, *et al.*, 2017). The level of Pb in the control area was lower than those obtained near the mine fields, this suggest that the source of Pb contamination of vegetable may be attributed to the mining activities in the

area. The consumption of vegetables grown near coal mines may cause disruption of the biosynthesis of hemoglobin and anemia, rise in blood pressure, kidney damage, miscarriages and subtle abortions, disruption of nervous systems and brain damage due to the high concentration of Pb in the environment (Tasrina *et al.*, 2015).

#### 4.7. Carcinogenic Risk

The cancer risk (CR) was calculated by multiplying the average daily intake (in mg/(kg<sup>-1</sup> day) over a lifetime) with a cancer slope factor (SF) presented in table 2. Cancer Risk is estimated as the incremental probability of an individual developing cancer over a lifetime (Bianchini *et al.*, 2002; Kamińska *et al.*, 2015). Acceptable risk levels for carcinogens range from 10<sup>-4</sup> (risk of developing cancer over a human lifetime is 1 in 10000) to 10<sup>-6</sup> (risk of developing cancer over a human lifetime is 1 in 1000000) (USEPA, 2010). For example, a CR of 10<sup>-4</sup> indicates a probability of 1 in 10,000 individuals developing cancer. Table 2 shows Carcinogenic Risk values of Cd (0.0668), Cr (0.0157), Fe (0.2432), Mn (0.1070), Ni (0.0340), and Pb (0.0003), respectively, all greater than 10<sup>-4</sup>, samples indicating a high potential carcinogenic risk in vegetables. Among the six investigated metals, Mn, Cd, Cr, and Ni were of greatest concern for their carcinogenicity (Stevens *et al.*, 2011, Wang *et al.*, 2015). According to the USEPA, a one to one hundred in a million chance of additional human cancer over a 70-year lifetime (10<sup>-6</sup> – 10<sup>-4</sup>) is regarded as an acceptable or inconsequential risk (USEPA, 2010).

#### 4.8. The Health Risk Index (HRI)

The Health Risk Index (HRI) has been recognized as a useful indicator for evaluation of risk associated with the consumption of metals in contaminated food (Sridhara *et al.*, 2008, Oluwole *et al.*, 2013; Ihedioha *et al.*, 2016). The health risk assessment in this study was done for some metals (Ni, Fe, Cr, Cd, Pb and Mn) as shown in table 2. The HRIs of Ni, Cd, Cr and Pb (for Vegetable Samples) were higher than 1 (HRI > 1), indicating high risk of heavy metal contamination. According to Khan *et al.*, (2009), if the value of HRI is less than 1 (HRI < 1), the health risk to the population is considered acceptable. On the other hand, if the HRI is equal or greater than 1 (HRI ≥ 1) the population is exposed to unacceptable health risk (Okunola *et al.*, 2011).

---

### 5. Conclusion and Recommendation

The concentrations of iron (Fe) and nickel (Ni) in the vegetable test samples were comparatively lower than the permissible limits of FAO/WHO (2008) for plants. Fe was found to have a significant correlation with Cr, this suggest that their contamination could be influenced by the coal mining activities or geology of the study area. This call for frequent research to determine the level of these metals on other components such as soil, water, air etc. around the study area.

---

### Compliance with ethical standards

#### *Acknowledgments*

The authors would like to thank the Sheda Science and Technology Complex (SHESTCO) Abuja and the department of Chemical Science Federal University, Wukari, Taraba State for their support.

#### *Disclosure of conflict of interest*

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

---

### References

- [1] Adamu, C. I., Nganje, T. N., & Edet, A. (2015). Heavy metal contamination and health risk assessment associated with abandoned barite mines in Cross River State, southeastern Nigeria. *Environmental Nanotechnology, monitoring & management*, 3, 10-21.
- [2] Bett, L., Ongera, G., Wangila, P., & Mule, S. (2019). Determination of some heavy metals in soils and vegetables samples from Kericho West Sub-county, Kenya.
- [3] Bianchini, F., Kaaks, R., & Vainio, H. (2002). Overweight, obesity, and cancer risk. *The lancet oncology*, 3(9), 565-574.

- [4] Boularbah, A., Schwartz, C., Bitton, G., Abouddrar, W., Ouhammou, A. and Morel, J.L. (2006). Heavy metal contamination from mining sites in South Morocco: 2. Assessment of metal accumulation and toxicity in plants. *Chemosphere* 63(5):811–817.
- [5] Castro-González, M. I., & Méndez-Armenta, M. (2017). Heavy metals: Implications associated to fish consumption. *Environmental toxicology and pharmacology*, 26(3), 263-271.
- [6] Chandrashekara UM, Thasini VM (2016) Non-crop edible plants and medicinal plants in Homegarden Agroforestry System of Palakkad District, Kerala. *Int J Ecol Environ Sci* 42(2):183–191.
- [7] Codex Alimentarius. (2015). “Codex general standard for contaminants and toxins in food and feed”. CODEX STAN 193-1995. *Joint FAO/WHO*; p. 59.
- [8] Dontala, S. P., Reddy, T. B., & Vadde, R. (2015). Environmental aspects and impacts its mitigation measures of corporate coal mining. *Procedia Earth and Planetary Science*, 11, 2-7.
- [9] Enetimi Idah Seiyaboh and Sylvester Chibueze Izah (2019). Impacts of Soil Pollution on Air Quality under Nigerian Setting. *Journal of Soil and Water Science*. Volume 3(1); p. 4.
- [10] Feng J, Wang Y, Zhao J, Zhu L, Bian X, Zhang W (2011). Source attributions of heavy metals in rice plant along highway in Eastern China. *J Environ Sci* 23(7):1158–1164.
- [11] Girigisu, S., Aduloju, E. I., Abubakar, A., & Olanrewaju, M. O. (2020). Comparative Study of Heavy Metals in Plant and Soil of Some Selected Medicinal Plant. *Fudma Journal of Sciences*, 4(1), 714-721.
- [12] Iftikhar A., Muhammad I., Muhammad B.H. and Sabir H. (2017). Chemical Pollution Control with Microorganisms. (Ed.) Naser A. Anjum. *Nova Sci. Publisher*, p. 197-243.
- [13] Ihedioha, J. N., Ujam, O. T., Nwuche, C. O., Ekere, N. R., & Chime, C. C. (2016). Assessment of heavy metal contamination of rice grains (*Oryza sativa*) and soil from Ada field, Enugu, Nigeria: Estimating the human health risk. *An International Journal of Human and Ecological Risk Assessment*. 22(8), 1665-1677.
- [14] Järup, L. (2003). Hazards of heavy metal contamination. *British medical bulletin*, 68(1), 167-182.
- [15] Ji, C., Kong, C. X., Mei, Z. L., & Li, J. (2017). A review of the anaerobic digestion of fruit and vegetable waste. *Applied Biochemistry and Biotechnology*, 183(3), 906-922.
- [16] Kabata-Pendias, A. (2000). Trace elements in soils and plants. CRC press.
- [17] Kamińska, M., Ciszewski, T., Łopacka-Szatan, K., Miotła, P., & Starosławska, E. (2015). Breast cancer risk factors. *Menopause Review/Przegląd Menopauzalny*, 14(3), 196-202.
- [18] Keshavarzi B, Moore F, Ansari M, Mehr MR, Kaabi H, Kermani M (2015) Macronutrients and trace metals in soil and food crops of Isfahan Province, Iran. *Environ Monit Assess* 187(1):4113.
- [19] Khan, S., Farooq, R., Shahbaz, S., Khan, M. A., & Sadique, M. (2009). Health risk assessment of heavy metals for population via consumption of vegetables. *World Appl Sci J*, 6(12), 1602-1606.
- [20] Moyo, B., Matodzi, V., Legodi, M. A., Pakade, V. E., & Tavengwa, N. T. (2020). Determination of Cd, Mn and Ni accumulated in fruits, vegetables and soil in the Thohoyandou town area, South Africa. *Water SA*, 46(2), 285-290.
- [21] Oluwole, S. O., Olubunmi, M. S. C., Kafeelah, A. Y., Olusegun, O. F., & Ayobami, O. O. (2013). Determination of heavy metal contaminants in leafy vegetables cultivated by the road side. *Int J Eng Res Dev*, 7(3), 1-5.
- [22] Orisakwe, O. E., Dagur, E. A., Mbagwu, H. O. C., Udowelle, N. A., & Offor, S. J. (2018). Levels of some heavy metals in vegetables from artisanal mining sites of Dilimi River, Bukuru and Barkin Ladi North Central Nigeria: any public health concern?. *Roczniki Państwowego Zakładu Higieny*, 69(4), 1-2.
- [23] Roslan NA, Syed Ismail SN, Praveena SM (2016) The transfer factor of cadmium in fern leaves and its potential health risk. *Asia Pac Environ Occup Health J* 2(2):48–57.
- [24] Sesugh Ande, 2Alhaji Simon Ekere and 1Ishaq ShaibuEneji (2021). Determination of Physicochemical Parameters of Water and Soil Samples around Owukpa Coal Mine, Benue State Nigeria. *ChemSearch Journal* 12(1): 120 – 131, June, 2021.
- [25] Shahid M, Dumat C, Khalid S, Schreck E, XiongT, Niazi NK (2017) Foliar heavy metal uptake, toxicity and detoxification in plants: a comparison of foliar and root metal uptake. *J Hazard Mater* 325:36–58.

- [26] Sharma, K., Ko, E. Y., Assefa, A. D., Ha, S., Nile, S. H., Lee, E. T., & Park, S. W. (2015). Temperature-dependent studies on the total phenolics, flavonoids, antioxidant activities, and sugar content in six onion varieties. *Journal of Food and Drug Analysis*, 23(2), 243-252.
- [27] Stevens, R. G., Hansen, J., Costa, G., Haus, E., Kauppinen, T., Aronson, K. J., and Straif, K. (2011). Considerations of circadian impact for defining 'shift work' in cancer studies: IARC Working Group Report. *Occupational and environmental medicine*, 68(2), 154-162.
- [28] Tasrina, R. C., Rowshon, A. A. M. R., Mustafizur, A. M. R., Rafiqul, I., & Ali, M. P. (2015). Heavy metals contamination in vegetables and its growing soil. *J Environ Anal Chem*, 2(142), 2.
- [29] USEPA (2008). Sample Pretreatment by Digestion in Water Analysis Handbook (5th Ed.). HACH Company, Loveland, Colorado, USA.
- [30] USEPA (2010) Risk Based Concentration Table US Environmental Protection Agency Washington. DC/Philadelphia:PA. Available from: <http://www.epa.gov/reg3hwmd/risk/human/index.htm>.
- [31] Valko, M. M. H. C. M., Morris, H., & Cronin, M. T. D. (2005). Metals, toxicity and oxidative stress. *Current medicinal chemistry*, 12(10), 1161-1208.
- [32] Wang, J., Cao, X., Liao, J., Huang, Y., & Tang, X. (2015). Carcinogenic potential of PAHs in oil-contaminated soils from the main oil fields across China. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 22(14), 10902-10909.
- [33] World Health Organization. (2006). The world health report 2006: working together for health. World Health Organization.
- [34] World Health Organization. (2011). Water safety in buildings. World Health Organization.
- [35] World Health Organization. (2018). What Quantitative and Qualitative Methods Have Been Developed to Measure Community Empowerment at a National Level? (Vol. 59).
- [36] Yebpella G.G., A.M. Magomya; R. Odoh; U.U. Udiba; E. A. Kamba; I. Gandu (2014). Heavy Metals Impact on Irrigated Vegetable Food Crops Consumed in Zaria. *Journal of Applied Science And Research*, 2 (1):197-204.
- [37] Yebpella, G. G., Adeyemi, H. M., Hammuel, C., Magomya, A. M., Agbaji, A. S., & Okonkwo, E. M. (2011). Phytochemical screening and comparative study of antimicrobial activity of Aloe vera various extracts. *African Journal of Microbiology Research*, 5(10), 1182-1187.
- [38] Zhang, P.; Qin, C.; Hong, X.; Kang, G.; Qin, M.; Yang, D.; Pang, B.; Li, Y.; He, J.; Dick, R.P (2018). Risk assessment and source analysis of soil heavy metal pollution from lower reaches of Yellow River irrigation in China. *Sci. Total Environ.* 633,1136–1147
- [39] Zhao S, & Duo L (2015) Bioaccumulation of cadmium, copper, zinc, and nickel by weed species from municipal solid waste compost. *Pol J Environ Stud* 24(1):413–417.
- [40] Zhou, Z., Liu, X., Sun, K., Lin, C., Ma, J., He, M., & Ouyang, W. (2019). Persulfate-based advanced oxidation processes (AOPs) for organic-contaminated soil remediation: A review. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 372, 836-851.